

## MINISYMPOSIUM

**EPIDEMIC MODELS: FROM INDIVIDUAL DECISION TO COLLECTIVE DYNAMICS**

GABRIEL TURINICI

**Organizer:** Université Paris Dauphine, PSL Research University, France & Institut Universitaire de France  
Gabriel.Turinici@dauphine.fr

**Minisymposium Keywords:** Behavioral epidemiology, Vaccination coverage, epidemic, epidemic propagation

Mathematical epidemiology produces many models to describe the epidemic propagation; however, until recently, the individuals were treated as "mechanical particles" who react to external stimuli in a pre-defined fashion. However, experimental data suggests that the decisions that people make influence in a non-negligible way the overall epidemic dynamics, i.e., the dynamics depends on the behavior of the individuals. The decision can appear at several levels:

- for vaccine-preventable diseases (when vaccination is not compulsory) the individual (or his/her parents) can decide whether to vaccinate or not (the so called "vaccination games"): although the decision of a single individual does not influence the course of the epidemic, the overall sum of individual decisions have a strong impact and has to be taken into account by the public health authorities;
- when the prevention measures are expensive (in terms of time, money, ...) the amount of prevention is a decision variable (for instance it can depend on the infection risk);
- the information spread on social networks can lead to vaccination decisions related to what close acquaintances have done.

The goal of this mini-symposium is to bring together researchers interested in the mathematical models that quantify this impact of individual level decisions to the overall epidemic dynamics.

**Acknowledgements:** The organiser acknowledges financial support from the Institut Universitaire de France and Université Paris Dauphine, PSL Research University.

*Minisymposium: Epidemic models: from individual decision to collective dynamics*

## **PUBLIC HEALTH INTERVENTION IN BEHAVIORAL VACCINATION MODELS: ANALYSIS AND CONTROL**

BRUNO BUONOMO

buonomo@unina.it

Department of Mathematics and Applications, University of Naples Federico II, Italy

Joint work with Alberto d'Onofrio (IPRI-Lyon), Piero Manfredi (University of Pisa), Rossella Della Marca (University of Parma)

*Keyword:* Behavioral epidemiology.

When children vaccination is not mandatory, the choice to vaccinate or not vaccinate children is often the result of the balance between two perceived risks: the risk of infection and the risk of side effects caused by the vaccine. This phenomenon is known as rational opposition (or pseudo-rational exemption) to vaccination. The rational opposition is paradoxically due to the vaccine-induced rarity of many infectious diseases and may result in a decline in vaccination coverage and consequently an increased risk of future resurgence of infection [1] (see also A. d'Onofrio's talk in this minisymposium). However, the *Public Health System* (PHS) may enact public campaigns to favor vaccine uptake.

In this talk we present some very recent results in the framework of behavioral epidemiology [2] concerning the interplay between private vaccination choices and actions of PHS to favor vaccine propensity [3, 4, 5] The impact of key 'components' on the disease transmission are investigated, including seasonality, latency time and, of course, human behavior. The main tools used include qualitative analysis of dynamical systems and optimal control theory.

*Minisymposium: Epidemic models: from individual decision to collective dynamics*

## VACCINE OPINION DYNAMICS: IMITATION GAME RELOADED

ALBERTO D'ONOFRIO

alberto.donofrio@i-pri.org

International Prevention Research Institute, Lyon, France,

&

Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Strathclyde University, Glasgow, Scotland, UK

Joint work with Bruno Buonomo (Department of Mathematics, Naples University, Italy) and Piero Manfredi (Department of Economics, Pisa University, Italy)

*Keywords:* Behavioral Epidemiology, Imitation Game, Vaccine Hesitancy.

Behavioural Epidemiology of Infectious Diseases (BE) [6] is the new discipline that aims at modeling the role of human behavior in the spread and in the control of Infectious Diseases. BE stemmed from the fact that classical behavior-free mathematical models based on statistical mechanics are often not adequate to describe the complex challenges induced by the Post-Trust Society.

In presence of a widespread vaccine hesitancy, for example, it is fundamental to model the dynamics of vaccine propensity (VP) that is determined by the out-balance between information on the disease spread and information and rumors on (real and imaginary) vaccine-related side effects [9]. Moreover it is of relevance also the modeling of actions enacted by Public Health authorities to favour vaccine uptake [10] (see B. Buonomo's talk in this Minisymposium).

A classical tool of BE to represent the vaccine propensity dynamics is the imitation game dynamics (IGD) [8, 9, 10], a classical tool of Game Theory frequently used in Theoretical Economy. In this Talk we will review some recent results on IGD in BE (and on its limitations).

In particular, we will shortly illustrate:

- Economy-free modeling of IGD as a double contagion of ideas [7]
- The interplay between IGD of VP and the demographic changes in the target population [11]
- Modeling of irrationality [12]
- Going beyond imitation Dynamics [13]

Other important topics such as putting the IGD for VP in the right economic context will be illustrated in the B. Buonomo's talk.

*Minisymposium: Epidemic models: from individual decision to collective dynamics*

## **SOCIAL DISTANCING EPIDEMIC GAMES, DIAGNOSIS, AND INCOMPLETE INFORMATION**

TIM RELUGA

treluga@math.psu.edu

Center for Infectious Disease Dynamics (CIDDD), Penn State University, USA

*Keywords:* Epidemic game, Infection risk, Prevention and infection risk, Incomplete information decision.

Within the epidemic game literature, there is a disagreement over whether increases in infection risk can discourage prevention. In one theory, increases in infection pressure motivate prevention, while in another, there is a turning-point beyond which investments drop off. The discrepancies between these theories can be resolved by modeling diagnosis events explicitly. A unified theory exhibits a turning-point in the optimal social-distancing response to infection pressure. The turning point is a consequence of decision making under incomplete information. With reliable diagnosis, prevention always offsets infection risk. Without reliable diagnosis, individuals may be best-off assuming they are infected once infection pressures are sufficiently high. This creates a public-health trap with high prevalence that can not be escaped by unilateral action. After estimate conditions for HIV, it seems the turning-point effects may contribute to traps for core-groups found in some sub-Saharan countries.

*Minisymposium: Epidemic models: from individual decision to collective dynamics*

## A MEAN FIELD GAMES APPROACH TO IMPERFECT VACCINATION

FRANCESCO SALVARANI

francesco.salvarani@unipv.it

CEREMADE, Université Paris-Dauphine, PSL Research University, France

&

Dipartimento di Matematica, Università degli Studi di Pavia, Italy

Joint work with Gabriel Turinici (CEREMADE, Université Paris-Dauphine, PSL Research University, France, & Institut Universitaire de France)

*Keywords:* Individual vaccination strategies, Mean field games.

We analyze a model of agent based vaccination campaign against influenza with imperfect vaccine efficacy and durability of protection. We prove the existence of a Nash equilibrium by Kakutani's fixed point theorem in the context of non-persistent immunity. Subsequently, we propose and test a novel numerical method to find the equilibrium. Various issues of the model are then discussed, such as the dependence of the optimal policy with respect to the imperfections of the vaccine, as well as the best vaccination timing. The numerical results show that, under specific circumstances, some counter-intuitive behaviors are optimal, such as, for example, an increase of the fraction of vaccinated individuals when the efficacy of the vaccine is decreasing up to a threshold.

**Acknowledgements:** This research program is supported by the *Agence Nationale de la Recherche* (ANR), projects *EMAQS* (ANR-11-BS01-0017), *Kimega* (ANR-14-ACHN-0030-01), *Kibord* (ANR-13-BS01-0004) and *CINE-PARA* (ANR-15-CE23-0019).

## References

- [1] Wang, Z., Bauch, C. T., Bhattacharyya, S., d'Onofrio, A., Manfredi, P., Perc, M., Perra, N, Salathe, M, Zhao, D. Statistical physics of vaccination. *Physics Reports*, 664, 1–113 (2016)
- [2] Manfredi P., d'Onofrio A. (eds.): *Modeling the interplay between human behavior and the spread of infectious diseases*. Springer, New York, 2013
- [3] Buonomo B., Carbone G., d'Onofrio A.: Effect of seasonality on the dynamics of an imitation–based vaccination model with public health intervention. *Math. Biosci. Eng.*, 15, n.1, 299–321 (2018)
- [4] Buonomo B., Della Marca R., d'Onofrio A.: Optimal public health intervention in a behavioral vaccination model: the interplay between seasonality, behavior and latency period. Submitted
- [5] Buonomo B., d'Onofrio A., Manfredi P.: Public health intervention to shape voluntary vaccination: continuous and piecewise optimal control. Submitted
- [6] P. Manfredi and A. d'Onofrio. *Modeling the interplay between human behavior and the spread of infectious diseases*. Springer, New York, 2013.
- [7] Wang, Z., Bauch, C. T., Bhattacharyya, S., d'Onofrio, A., Manfredi, P., Perc, M., Perra, N, Salathe, M, Zhao, D. (2016). *Statistical physics of vaccination*, *Physics Reports* 664, 1–113.
- [8] Bauch, C. T. (2005). *Imitation dynamics predict vaccinating behaviour*. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 272(1573), 1669–1675
- [9] A. d'Onofrio, P. Manfredi, P. Poletti (2011) *The impact of vaccine side effects on the natural history of immunization programmes: an imitation-game approach.*, *J Theor Biol* 273, 63–71 .
- [10] A. d'Onofrio, P. Manfredi, P. Poletti (2012) *The interplay of public intervention and private choices in determining the outcome of vaccination programmes*, *PLoS ONE* 7(10), Article n. e45653.
- [11] A. d'Onofrio, P. Manfredi (2018) *The interplay between vaccine propensity dynamics and demographic dynamics* (submitted).
- [12] A. d'Onofrio, P. Manfredi (2018) *The irrational component in the vaccine propensity dynamics* (submitted).
- [13] A. d'Onofrio, P. Manfredi (2018) *Dynamics of vaccine propensity under voluntary vaccinations: going beyond the imitation game dynamics* (submitted).